

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

SEAN SMITH and CRYSTAL SMITH,)
)
Plaintiffs,)
)
v.) Case No.: CIV-17-1302-D
)
CSAA FIRE AND CASUALTY)
INSURANCE COMPANY,)
)
Defendant.)

**DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL
SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND SUPPORTING BRIEF
TABLE OF CONTENTS AND AUTHORITIES**

Respectfully submitted,

Gerard F. Pignato, OBA No. 11473
R. Greg Andrews, OBA No. 19037
Dixie A. Craven, OBA No. 31528
PIGNATO, COOPER, KOLKER & ROBERSON, P.C.
Robinson Renaissance Building
119 North Robinson Avenue, 11th Floor
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73102
Telephone: 405-606-3333
Facsimile: 405-606-3334
Email: jerry@pclaw.org
greg@andrews.law
dixie@pclaw.org

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT, CSAA
FIRE AND CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY**

January 24, 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|---------|
| TABLE OF CONTENTS..... | i |
| TABLE OF AUTHORITIES..... | ii, iii |
| BRIEF IN SUPPORT..... | 1 |
| FACTUAL BACKGROUND..... | 1 |
| STATEMENT OF MATERIAL, UNDISPUTED FACTS. | 3 |
| ARGUMENTS AND AUTHORITIES..... | 12 |
| PROPOSITION I: SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARD..... | 12 |
| PROPOSITION II: THE UNDISPUTED FACTS DEMONSTRATE, AS A MATTER OF LAW, THAT CSAA'S INVESTIGATION OF PLAINTIFFS' EARTHQUAKE CLAIM WAS REASONABLE..... | 12 |
| PROPOSITION III: PLAINTIFFS' PUNITIVE DAMAGE CLAIM FAILS AS THE UNDISPUTED FACTS LACK EVIDENCE OF "RECKLESS DISREGARD."..... | 17 |
| PROPOSITION IV: EVIDENCE OF ENGINEERING REPORTS FROM OTHER CLAIMS NOT INVOLVED IN THIS LAWSUIT CANNOT BE INTRODUCED AS EVIDENCE OF BAD FAITH. | 18 |
| A. Evidence of Other Rimkus Reports is Irrelevant to Plaintiffs' Bad Faith Claim..... | 19 |
| B. Even if the Other Rimkus Reports are Relevant, Their Probative Value is Substantially Outweighed by Unfair Prejudice, Confusion of the Issues, Misleading the Jury, and Undue Delay. | 20 |
| C. Evidence of Other Reports is Inadmissible Evidence of Unrelated Conduct..... | 22 |
| D. If this Court Determined that the Other Reports are Admissible, Only Those Reports CSAA had at the Time Performance was Requested in this Case are Relevant. | 23 |
| E. Evidence of Other Reports is Inadmissible Hearsay. | 24 |
| CONCLUSION..... | 24 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

| | |
|--|------------|
| <i>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby</i> , 477 U.S. 242 (1986)..... | 12 |
| <i>Badillo v. Mid Century Ins. Co.</i> , 121 P.3d 1080, 2005 OK 48,..... | 13, 14, 18 |
| <i>Birdsell v. Birdsell</i> , 671 P.2d 80, 1983 OK CIV APP 41. | 19 |
| <i>Black v. M & W Gear Co.</i> , 269 F.3d 1220 (10th Cir. (Okla.) 2001)..... | 19 |
| <i>Buzzard v. McDanel</i> , 736 P.2d 157, 1987 OK 28.. .. | 15, 16, 18 |
| <i>Cardoso v. Calbone</i> , 490 F.3d 1194 (10 th Cir. 2007)..... | 12 |
| <i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317 (1986)..... | 12 |
| <i>Christian v. American Home Assur. Co.</i> , 577 P.2d 899 (Okla. 1977)..... | 13, 19 |
| <i>City Nat'l Bank and Trust Co. v. Jackson Nat'l Life Ins.</i> , 804 P.2d 463, 1990 OK CIV APP 89. | 20 |
| <i>Coletti v. Cudd Pressure Control</i> , 165 F.3d 767 (10th Cir. 1999)..... | 19 |
| <i>Frank v. Mayberry</i> , 985 P.2d 773, 1999 OK 63.. .. | 17 |
| <i>Garnett v. Government Employees Ins. Co.</i> , 186 P.3d 935 (Okla. 2008)..... | 14 |
| <i>Greenberg v. Service Business Forms Industries, Inc.</i> , 882 F.2d 1538 (10th Cir. (Okla.) 1989)..... | 19 |
| <i>Lewis v. Farmers Ins. Co., Inc.</i> , 681 P.2d 67 (Okla. 1983)..... | 15 |

| | |
|---|--------|
| <i>McCorkle v. Great Atlantic Insurance Co.,</i> 637 P.2d 583, 1981 OK 128. | 14 |
| <i>Navarez v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.,</i> 989 P.2d 1051, 1999 OK CIV APP 92. | 14 |
| <i>Owens v. State,</i> 229 P.3d 1261, 2010 OK CR 1. | 22 |
| <i>Porter v. Oklahoma Farm Bureau Mut. Ins. Co.,</i> 330 P.3d 511, 2014 OK 50. | 23, 24 |
| <i>Roberts v. State Farm Mut. Auto,</i> 61 Fed.Appx. 587, 2003 WL 1559155, (10 th Cir. Mar. 26, 2003). | 16 |
| <i>Rodebush by and through Rodebush v. Oklahoma Nursing Homes, Ltd.,</i> 867 P.2d 1241, 1993 OK 160. | 17 |
| <i>Sides v. John Cordes, Inc.,</i> 981 P.2d 301, 1999 OK 36. | 17 |
| <i>Skinner v. John Deere Ins. Co.,</i> 998 P.2d 1219, 2000 OK 18. | 13, 14 |
| <i>Willis v. Midland Risk Ins. Co.,</i> 42 F.3d 607 (10 th Cir. 1994). | 14 |
| <i>Wilson v. Muckala,</i> 303 F.3d 1207 (10th Cir. 2002). | 22, 23 |

Other Authorities

| | |
|-----------------------------|--------|
| FED. R. CIV. P. 56. | 1, 12 |
| FED.R.EVID. Rule 401. | 19, 22 |
| FED.R.EVID. Rule 403. | 21, 22 |
| FED.R.EVID. Rule 404. | 22 |
| Local Civil Rule 56.1. | 1 |
| 23 O.S. § 9.1. | 17 |

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Gerard F. Pignato

Gerard F. Pignato, OBA No. 11473
R. Greg Andrews, OBA No. 19037
Dixie A. Craven, OBA No. 31528
PIGNATO, COOPER, KOLKER & ROBERSON, P.C.
Robinson Renaissance Building
119 North Robinson Avenue, 11th Floor
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73102
Telephone: 405-606-3333
Facsimile: 405-606-3334
Email: jerry@pclaw.org
greg@andrews.law
dixie@pclaw.org

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT, CSAA
FIRE AND CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 24, 2019, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk of Court using the ECF System for filing. Based on the records currently on file, the Clerk of Court will transmit a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

Steven S. Mansell, Esquire
Mark A. Engel, Esquire
Kenneth G. Cole, Esquire
M. Adam Engel, Esquire

s/ Gerard F. Pignato
For the Firm